SINDH EDU	CATION FOUNDATIO	SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION GOVERNMENT OF SINDH	
RFP FOR 1	HIRING OF SHORTLISTING FI	RFP FOR HIRING OF SHORTLISTING FIRM FOR H.R (Ref. SEF/NP/15-16/36)	
Evaluation Technical & Financial Proposals:			
TECHNICAL EVALUATION:	M/s.National Testing Services	M/s. Pakistan Testing Services	M/s. National Examination & Evaluation Foundation.
Technical Points out of 100	80.80	16.00	73.00
Ranking at Technical score	1st	2nd	3rd
FINANCIAL EVALUATION:	· ·		
Financials Prices	1,537,200	837,200	1,957,200
Financials Points out of 100	54.46	100.00	42.78
Ranking at Financial score	2nd	1st	3rd
Consolidate ranking according to the formula to calculate the highest combined achieving Tech & Fin score ($S = St x T\% + Sf x P\%$).	M/s. National Testing Services bid has been rejected due to non submittion of bid security 3% as per requirement of RPF.	82.00	65.44
Ranking at Consolidate Marks:	2nd	1st	3rd
Note:			

2)The Consultant Selection Committee recommended M/s.Pakistan Testing Services at top(1st)ranking on the basis of technical & Financial Evaluation as per QCB selection method, this is for kind approval of Competent Authority of SEF.

MEMBERS OF CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE

Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh

Plainning officer,

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Assistant Director (AASP) Mr. Mubashir Mrza

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh,

Plainning & Development Dept. Govt. of Sindh Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation Govt. of Sindh,

Secretary Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation Depurty Director (M&E) Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Syed Wajad Ali Shah

Sindh Education Foundation Depurty Secretary (LF)Finance

Govt. of Sindh,

Govt. of Sindh,

Approved By

M/s.Naheed S. Durrani

Sindh Education Foundation Govt. of Sindh,

Chairman Consultant Selection Committee

Director POR/DMD

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh,

Managing Director

Bid Evaluation Report

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Sindh Education Foundation (Govt. of Sindh)

2. Tender Reference No: SEF/NP/15-16/36.

3. Tender Description/Name of work/item: Hiring Of Shortlisting H.R Firm.

4. Method of Procurement: QCBS Method

5. Tender Published: SPPRA ID # 2147483647 (02-03-2016

Jang Urdu 27/02/2016), Dawn English 29/02/2016,Kawish 27/02/2016.

6. Total RFP documents Issued: 5

7. Technical Bid Opening date: (if applicable) 17 March,2016.

8. No. of Bid technically qualified (if applicable): 3

9. Total Bids Received:3 Bids Received.

10. Finincial Bid Opening Date: 28th April, 2016.

S No	Name of Firm or Bidder	Total Bid,Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of consolidate (Tech & Finan) evaluation	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejection Through QCBS selection methord and rating calculated of formula (s=stxt%+sfxP%)	Remarks
0	1		3	4	5	6
1	M/s.Pakistan Testing Service	837,200	1st	1 Million	Because of top in ranking	Recommended to award the contract.
2	M/s. National Testing Service	1,537,200	The Firm is out of competation due to non submission of Bid Security as per requirement of RFP.	1 Million	Bid Security Non Submitted as per RFP	Not Recommended to award the contract.
3	M/s. National Examination & Evaluation Foundation	1,957,200	2nd	1 Million	2nd	Not Recommended to award the contract.

MEMBERS OF CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE

Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali

Deputy Director (M&E)
Secretary of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Mubashir Mirza

Assistant Director (AASP)

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh

Planning officer,

Planning & Development Dept. Govt. of Sindh

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah,

Deputy Sec. (LF) Finance, Govt. of Sindh

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Aziz Kabani

Director POR/DMD

Chairman of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh,



SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION **GOVT. OF SINDH**



(HEAD OFFICE) SEF (Plot. No. 21/A, Block No.7& 8 Overseas Cooperative Housing Society, Ameer Khusro Road) Karachi. 021-34169182 & 184

ATTENDANCE SLIP

Date: 28TH April, 2016.

Tender No. SEF/NP/2015-16/36

RFP FOR: FINANCIAL PROPOSALS OPENING FOR HIRING OF SHORTLISTING FIRM OF H.R.

Following firms submitted their Financial Bid.

S.No.	Name Of Participant Firm	Attended By (Name)	Contact (Cell #)	Signatures
1	PTS	Absent		
2	NTS	Aprent		
3	NESEF	Absent		
4				,

Loudly announced bid information of bidders:

S.No.	Names of Firms	Bid Value in PKR	Bid Security in PKR	Bidder's Signature
1.	PTS	837200/=	25116=	
2.	NTS	1537200/=	24000	
3.	NEGEF	1957200	58716/=	
		1		

Acting Deputy Director Procurement,

Sindh Education Foundation.



SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION GOVT. OF SINDH

(HEAD OFFICE)





MEMBERS OF CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE

Mr. Mubashir Mirza Assistant Director, (AASP)

Member of Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation, Govt. of Sindh,

Sign: Wr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah,
Deputy Sec. (LF) Finance

Member of Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation,

Govt. of Sindh,

Sign:

Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh

Planning officer,

Planning & Development Dept.

Member of Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation,

Govt. of Sindh,

Sign:

Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali

Deputy Director (M & E), SEF

Secretary of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh,

COUNTERSIGN

My. Aziz Kabani Director POR/DMD

Chairman Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh

page 2 of 2 Mil.

SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION GOVERNMENT OF SINDH HIRING FOR SHORTLISTING OF HR FIRM (Ref. SEF/NP/15-16/36)

Evaluation of Technical Proposal

		M-1	Mr. M	ubashir	Mr. Mubashir Mirza (Member)	fember)													
		M-2	Mr. Ta	ufiq Ah	Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh(Member)	kh(Mem	(per)												
Consultant Selection Committee	ee	M-3	Mr. Sy.	ed Waji	Mr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah(Member)	h(Memt	er)												
		SEC	Mr.Na	wab Zai	Mr.Nawab Zafar Ali (Secretary)	ecretary													
		CHR	Mr. Az	iz Kaba	Mr. Aziz Kabani (Chairman)	man)													
Technical Proposal Opening Date			M/s	S.Nation	al Examir	nation &	Evaluation	M/S.National Examination & Evaluation Foundation		M/S.I	akistar	M/S.Pakistan Testing Services	Service			M/S.N	ational	M/S.National Testing Services	ervices
March 17th 2016	Marks	%			M	Marks Obtain	tain				Mari	Marks Obtain	_			Marks	Marks Obtain		
Criteria of Evaluation			M-1	M-2	M-3	SEC	CHR	Average	M-1	M-2 M	M-3 S	SEC CHR		Average	M-1 M-2	-2 M-3	-3 SEC	C CHR	R Average
Technical Approach	15	25%	10	12	11	11	12	11.20	11	13	12	12	13	12.20	12	13	12	13	13 12.60
Methodology	30	20%	18	20	18	20	19	19.00	19	22	21	20	22	20.80	25	24	23	23	
Work Plan	15	25%	12	12	12	12	12	12.00	12	12	=	12	11	11.60	11	13	12	12	
Total	09									-		-				+	+	+	
Team Leader (Manager 01)													r		t	+	+	+	
Qualification	12	40%	10	10	10	10	10	10.00	11	10	6	10	6	9.80	11	11	10	10	10.40
Competence	9	20%	4	5	9	4	2	4.80	2	2	9	2	9	5.40	5	5	2	4	5 4.80
Experience	12	40%	10	6	6	6	6	9.20	10	10	10	10	10	10.00	11	101	6	10	10.00
Total	30										-					+	+	+	
Senior Officers (02 in Nos)													-			H	\vdash	-	
Qualification	4	40%	3	3	3	3	3	3.00	m	m	3	3	3	3.00	m	m	2	m	3 2.80
Competence	2	20%	1	1	1	1	-	1.00	2	1	2	1	2	1.60	1	П	1	H	1.00
Experience	4	40%	3	m	2	c	ĸ	2.80	2	2	1	2	1	1.60	4	m	m	М	3 3.20
Total	10															-	\vdash	-	
GRAND TOTAL	100							73.00						76.00			\vdash	\vdash	80.80
Minimum 70 marks to qualify, Positions are;	itions ar	ić						3rd			\vdash	_		2nd	-	\vdash	H	\vdash	1st
										1	1	1			1	1	1	$\frac{1}{1}$	

Note: Above findings have made by the Consultant Selection Committee that M/s. Sindh testing Services has been out from technical evaluation & Disqualified due to not eligible as per our technical criteria NOTE:

The Consultant Selection Committee recommended above technical evaluation for further process of finacial proposals to be opened.

MEMBERS OF CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE

Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh Planning officer,

Assistant Director (AASP) Mr. Mubashir Mirza

Member of Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation Govt. of Sindh

Mr.Nawab Zafar Ali

ecretary of Consultant Selection Committee indh Education Foundation ovt. of Sindh Deputy Director (M&E)

Planning & Development Dept. Govt. of Sindh Member of Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation Govt. of Sindh

Member of Consultant Selection Committee Deputy Sec. (LF) Finance, Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah,

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Aziz Kabani Director POR/DMD

Chairman Censultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation, Govt. of Sindh

Page 1 of 1



SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION



Government of Sindh

MINUTES

HIRING OF SHORTLISTING FIRM FOR H.R (SEF/NP/15-16/36)

The Consultant Selection Committee Meeting, SEF, Karachi was held at 02.30 P.M on 28th April, 2016 in the conference room, Sindh Education Foundation, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi.

AGENDA:

Opening of Financial proposals of Hiring of Shortlisting Firm for H.R. (SEF/NP/15-16/36)

(28th April, 2016)

PARTICIPANTS:

The following consultant selection committee members & SEF Officers were participated in meeting:

S.No.	NAME OF OFFICERS	DESIGNATION	AUTHORITY	ATTENDANCE
I	Mr. Aziz Kabani	Director POR / DMD, SEF	Chairman Consultant Selection Committee	Present
II	Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali	Deputy Director (M & E) SEF	Secretary Consultant Selection Committee	Present
Ш	Mr. Mubashir Mirza	Assistant Director (AASP) SEF	Member of Consultant Selection Committee	Present
IV	Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh	Planning officer, Planning & Development Dept.	Member of Consultant Selection Committee	Present
V	Mr. Shakeel Representative from Mr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah	Deputy Sec. (LF) Finance	Member of Consultant Selection Committee	Present
V	Shahnawaz Ali Khan	Acting Deputy Director Procurement	••••	Present

HIRING OF SHORTLISTING FIRM FOR H.R (SEF/NP/15-16/36)

Following firms submitted their Profile:

S.No.	NAME OF PARTICIPANT FIRMS
a)	M/s. Pakistan Testing Service.
b)	M/s. National Testing Service
c)	M/s. National Examination & Evaluation Foundation

DICUSSION / DECISION:

- The meeting was commenced by the permission given by Chairman Consultant Selection Committee SEF.
- The Consultant Selection Committee found only Three Financial Proposals of the firms those were submitted by above firms.
- All the Representatives were absent.
- The Consultant Selection Committee put remarks on the bid of NTS that NTS Bid Security should be Rs.46,116/= (3%) but they provided bid security Rs.24,000/= which is low, therefore, the firm is disqualified.
- After evaluation the documents, Deputy Managing Director/Chairman Consultant Selection Committee handed over all related documents & papers to the members of consultant selection committee for further necessary process.

Minutes recorded by:

Shahnawaz Ali Khan Acting Deputy Director Procurement Department

MEMBERS OF CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE

Sign:

Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali-

Deputy Director (M & E)

Secretary of Consultant Selection Committee

203/6/2016

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh.

Sign:

Mr. Mubashir Mirza

Assistant Director, (AASP),

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh.

Sign:

Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh

Planning officer,

Planning & Development Dept.

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation,

Govt. of Sindh,

Sign:

Mr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah,

Deputy Sec. (LF) Finance

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation,

Govt. of Sindh,

COUNTERSIGN

Mr. Aziz Kabani Director POR/DMD

Chairman of consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh,



SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION



Government of Sindh

MINUTES

HIRING OF SHORTLISTING FIRM FOR H.R (SEF/NP/15-16/36)

The Consultant Selection Committee Meeting, SEF, Karachi was held at 02:30 P.M on 17th March, 2016 in the conference room, Sindh Education Foundation, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi.

AGENDA:

Opening of Technical Proposals of Hiring of Shortlisting Firm for H.R. (SEF/NP/15-16/36)

(17th March, 2016)

PARTICIPANTS:

The following consultant selection committee members & SEF Officers were participated in meeting:

S.No.	NAME OF OFFICERS	DESIGNATION	AUTHORITY	ATTENDANCE
I	Mr. Aziz Kabani	Director POR / DMD, SEF	Chairman Consultant Selection Committee	Present
II	Ms.Saima Siddiqui Representative from Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali	Deputy Director (M & E) SEF	Secretary Consultant Selection Committee	Present
Ш	Mr. Mubashir Mirza	Assistant Director (AASP) SEF	Member of Consultant Selection Committee	Present
IV	Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh	Planning officer, Planning & Development Dept.	Member of Consultant Selection Committee	Present
V	Mr. Shakeel Representative from Mr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah	Deputy Sec. (LF) Finance	Member of Consultant Selection Committee	Present
V	Shahnawaz Ali Khan	Acting Deputy Director Procurement	••••	Present

HIRING OF SHORTLISTING FIRM FOR H.R (SEF/NP/15-16/36)

Following firms submitted their Profile:

S.No.	NAME OF PARTICIPANT FIRMS
a)	M/s. National Examination & Evaluation Foundation.
b)	M/s. Pakistan Testing Service
c)	M/s. National Testing Service
d)	M/s. Sindh Testing Service

DICUSSION / DECISION:

- The meeting was commenced by the permission given by Chairman Consultant Selection Committee SEF.
- The Consultant Selection Committee found only Four Technical Proposals those were submitted by above firms.
- Three representative of the participated firm were presented and one representative of National Examination & Evaluation was not presented.
- After opening of financial proposals, The Chairman Consultant Selection Committee (Deputy Managing Director, SEF) handed over all related documents & papers to the Secretary & members of consultant selection committee for further necessary process.

Minutes recorded by:

Acting Deputy Director Procurement Department

HIRING OF SHORTLISTING FIRM FOR H.R (SEF/NP/15-16/36)

MEMBERS OF CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE

Sign:

Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali

Deputy Director (M & E)

Secretary of Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh.

Sign: Mr. Mubashir Mirza

Assistant Director, (AASP),

Member of Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh.

Sign:

Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh

Planning officer,

Planning & Development Dept.

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation,

Govt. of Sindh,

Sign:

Mr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah,

Deputy Sec. (LF) Finance

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

4-6-16

Sindh Education Foundation,

Govt. of Sindh,

COUNTERSIGN

Aziz Kabani

Director POR/DMD

Chairman of consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh,

SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION GOVERNMENT OF SIND **EVALUATION CRITERIA FOR HIRING OF SHORTLISTING H.R FIRMS**

SEF/NP/2015-16/36

EOI Opening Date 17/03/2	2016	
	M-1	Mr. Mubashir Mirza (Member)
	M-2	Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh(Member)
	M-3	Mr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah(Member)
	SEC	Mr.Nawab Zafar Ali (Secretary)
	CHR	Mr. Aziz Kabani (Chairman)

	CHK	IVIF. AZIZ	Kabani (Lnairman)	1															
Shortlisting Criteria	M/S.Na		xaminat oundati	ion & Eva on	aluation	М	/S.Pakist	an Testi	ng Servic	es	ı	M/S.Sind	lhTestin	g Service	s	N	1/S.Natio	nal Testing	Services	j
Member of the consitant selection Committee	M-1	M-2	M-3	SEC	СН	M-1	M-2	M-3	SEC	СН	M-1	M-2	M-3	SEC	СН	M-1	M-2	M-3	SEC	СН
A minimum of 3 years' experience of similar nature of assignments	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
A minimum financial turnover of 4 million per annum	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	ENF	ENF	ENF	ENF	ENF	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Tax registration with FBR and SRB authorities	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
FINDING														-						

Note: Above findings have made by the Consultant Selection Committee that M/s. Sindh Testing Service has been out from technical evaluation & Disqualified due to not eligible as per our technical criteria The Consultant Selection Committee recommended above evaluation for further process of technical evaluation.

Mr. Mubashir Mirza

(A.D AASP)

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation,

Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Taufiq Ahmed Sheikh

Planning officer,

Planning & Development Dept. Govt. of Sindh

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Syed Wajid Ali Shah,

Deputy Sec. (LF) Finance, Govt. of Sindh

Member of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh

Mr.Nawab Zafar Ali

Deputy Director (M&E)

Secretary of Consultant Selection Committee

Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh

Director POR/DMD

Chairman Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation

Govt. of Sindh